

Politics 9504b: Political Theory II, 2014-5: Revised.

Instructor: Richard Vernon, ravernon@uwo.ca, SSC 4216, office hours Monday 1-3 and other times by arrangement.

The theme is “disagreement in politics”. We will begin with an episode that marks the emergence of *the very idea that a polity can contain disagreement*, as opposed to requiring consensus of belief: the idea of religious “toleration”. How was it argued for, and how was it argued against? We will spend two weeks (1-2) discussing a late 17th-century debate, and then assess what contemporary theorists make of it (Week 3), and of the idea of “toleration” in general (Week 4). We will then fast-forward to the 19th century and re-read Mill *On Liberty*, in which disagreement is not just to be tolerated, but positively welcomed – why, exactly? (Weeks-5-6). Some readings on what to make of Mill follow (Week 7). The mid-term exam question will then be provided – a short article, describing an event, on which you will be asked to comment in light of our discussions so far. In Week 8 we will discuss your responses. We then move on to contemporary writings. In Week 9, Will Kymlicka’s defence of cultural diversity, and one of his critics; in Week 10, Elisabeth Galeotti’s move from toleration to recognition, and one of her critics; in Week 11, Iris Young’s “recognition” paradigm and one of her critics; in Week 12, we take a look at what recent psychological theory may have to say about political disagreement.

Evaluation:

Participation 25%

Midterm exam: 15%

Essay (due April 10): 60%. 12-15 pages is recommended. It is up to you to propose a topic that shows serious engagement with the course readings, and to discuss it with me at least a week in advance. It may involve additional reading, especially if it does not address Locke or Mill, to whom we will have devoted half the term.

A copy of all the readings will be made available for consultation or copying. Copies of the Locke/Proast debate and of Mill *On Liberty* are available in the bookstore but you are not required to buy them.

Readings:

1. Locke vs Proast – Round 1: Locke’s *Letter Concerning Toleration* and Proast’s *The Letter Concerning Toleration Briefly Consider’d and Answer’d*.
2. Locke vs Proast – Round 2: Locke’s *Second Letter* and Proast’s *Third Letter*.
3. Locke vs Proast: Who won? Jeremy Waldron , “Locke, Toleration and the Rationality of Persecution”, Paul Bou-Habib, “Sincerity and the Rationality of Persecution”, Richard Vernon, “Introduction” to *Locke on Toleration*.

4. Thoughts on toleration in general: the chapters by Williams, Fletcher, Scanlon in David Heyd ed., *Toleration: The Elusive Virtue*.
5. J.S. Mill, *On Liberty*, chapters 1-3.
6. *On Liberty*, chapters 4 and 5.
7. Readings on Mill – there are several good possibilities, the choice will depend on the issues that have become salient in our discussions. *Mid-term exam distributed, answers due following week*.
8. Discussion of midterm exam answers.
9. Will Kymlicka, *Liberalism, Community and Culture*, chapters 8 & 9, Anthony Appiah, *The Ethics of Identity*, chapter 4.
10. Elisabeth Galeotti, *Toleration as Recognition*, chapters 3 and 4, Peter Jones, "Toleration, Recognition and Identity."
11. Iris Young, *Justice and the Politics of Difference*, chapter 1, Brian Barry, *Culture and Equality*, chapter 3.
12. Jonathan Haidt, *The Righteous Mind*, chapters 6 and 7.