

Politics 9505b/Philosophy 9122b (Winter 2019): Toleration

Instructor: Richard Vernon ravernon@uwo.ca SSC 4216

In this course we shall examine the emergence of toleration as a political topic, in the debate between John Locke and Jonas Proast (1689-1704), consider the contemporary significance of toleration and the moral and/or epistemological premises on which it can be based, and finally discuss three case studies – the place of religion in public life, cultural accommodation, and the regulation of hate speech.

Topics and readings are listed below. Readings will be posted on OWL. The only required text is *Locke on Toleration* (Cambridge UP 2010, available in UWO bookstore and Weldon). It is assumed that students will have access to a copy of *Mill On Liberty*.

Evaluation: a final essay, due April 15, worth 70%: class participation, 30%. The essay (15-20 pages is expected) will critically explore one of the week's topics, while also showing an appreciation of its place in the overall theme of the class. I am open to proposals for essay topics that will span two or more weeks' readings.

1. Locke's toleration – was it Protestant, fallibilist, or egalitarian? Let's discuss it: *Locke on Toleration* pp 1-66.
2. Locke's toleration – was it Protestant, fallibilist, or egalitarian? Let's discuss it some more: *Locke on Toleration*, remainder of book
3. Interpretations: Vernon, *Locke on Toleration*, Introduction; Jeremy Waldron "Locke, Toleration and the Rationality of Persecution" in Susan Mendus ed, *Toleration* 1988, Adam Wolfson *Persecution or Toleration?* chapter 4
4. Toleration today (?): Bernard Williams "Toleration: A Moral or Political Question?" *Diogenes* 1996, George Fletcher "The Instability of Tolerance", in David Heyd ed. *Toleration: An Elusive Virtue*, T.M.Scanlon *The Difficulty of Tolerance* chapter 10
5. From toleration to recognition? Charles Taylor "The Politics of Recognition" in in Amy Gutmann ed. *Multiculturalism*, Anna Galeotti *Toleration as Recognition* chapter 4, Peter Jones "Toleration Recognition and Identity" *Journal of Political Philosophy* 2006.
6. Epistemic modesty: David Christensen "Disagreement as Evidence", *Philosophy Compass* 2009, Thomas Kelly "The Epistemic Significance of Disagreement and the Burdens of Judgment" in Gendler and Hawthorne eds. *Oxford Studies in Epistemology*, John Horton, "Reasonable Disagreement" in M. Dimova-Cookson and P. Stirk eds., *Multiculturalism and Moral Conflict*

7. The moral-pluralist case: Isaiah Berlin *The Crooked Timber of Humanity* chapter 2, Joseph Raz "Autonomy, Toleration and the Harm Principle" in Mendus ed. *Toleration*, Susan Wolf "Two Levels of Pluralism" *Ethics* 1992.
8. Agonism: W.B. Gallie "Essentially Contested Concepts" *Proceedings of the Aristotelean Society* 1956, Stuart Hampshire *Justice as Conflict* chapter 1.
9. Autonomy: J.S. Mill, *On Liberty* chapter 3, Sarah Conly *Against Autonomy* Cambridge UP 2013 chapter 1, Richard Thaler and Cass Sunstein *Nudge* New York: Penguin, chapter 1
10. Religion in public life: Robert Audi "The State, the Church and the Citizen" and Nicholas Wolterstorff "Why We Should Reject What Liberalism Tells Us" in Paul Weithman ed. *Religion and Contemporary Liberalism* U. of Notre Dame 1997, Richard Rorty "Religion in the Public Square" *Journal of Religious Ethics* 2003.
11. Cultural Accommodation: Will Kymlicka *Liberalism, Community and Culture* Oxford UP 1989 chapter 8, Kwame Anthony Appiah *The Ethics of Identity* Princeton UP 2003 chapter 4, Robert Sparrow "Defending Deaf Culture" *Journal of Political Philosophy* 2005.
12. Hate Speech: J.S. Mill *On Liberty* chapter 2, Dale Miller "J.S. Mill and Charlottesville" *Civil American* 2017, Robert Mark Simpson "Dignity, Harm and Hate Speech" *Law and Philosophy* 2013.