

Identity Politics
The University of Western Ontario
POL9533B
Winter 2018

Professor: Caroline Dick
Time: Tuesday 9:30 a.m.-11:20 a.m.
Classroom: SSC 4103

Office: SSC 4088
Email: cdick4@uwo.ca
Office Hours: Tues. 11:30-12:30;
Wed. 10:30-11:30 a.m.

Course Description:

This course focusses on identity politics in the Canadian context with a view to examining the rise of group activism around identity markers and the importance of identity politics in Canadian political, social and economic life. It will do so by examining the kinds of claims that identity groups advance and responses to those claims both in Canadian scholarship and in the legal and political realms.

To this end, the course is divided into five sections. The course begins by introducing students to the rise of ‘new social movements’ and the politics of identity, as well as some of the concerns that come with organizing around shared group identities. In the second part of the course, attention shifts to theories that employ substantive notions of identity to ground group claims and resolve disputes both between identity groups and the dominant society and between identity groups and their members. By examining the works of Charles Taylor, Will Kymlicka and Avigail Eisenberg, the second part of the course seeks to examine the challenges and pitfalls of using ‘identity’ as an organizing principle for political theory and the resolution of rights conflicts. The third part of the course focuses on specific identity groups. The goal here is not only to examine the kinds of claims that groups advance, but to assess the adequacy of institutional responses to said claims and the work that remains to be done.

While the first three parts of the course proceed from the position that identity can act as a catalyst for positive change, the fourth part leaves the notion of identity as a liberating construct behind to investigate the ways in which group identities can be deployed against identity groups by dominant others, including the state, to justify discrimination and exclusion. The course then concludes with an examination of the Indigenous Resurgence movement, which offers the possibility of reclaiming Indigenous identity and nationhood without engaging Canadian state structures that have historically asserted their power to name the content of Indigenous identity in destructive ways.

Course Materials

Many of the readings are available electronically. Those that are not available electronically are marked with a ✳.

Email

The Professor will respond to email and will do her best to reply within 48 hours. Emails sent on the weekend will be answered on Monday. Please do not send email messages via OWL. Do note that university policy precludes Professors from responding to email messages that were not sent from a Western email account. Note, also, that grades may not be discussed via email.

Web Site

There is a web site set up for this course at <https://owl.uwo.ca/portal>. The course syllabus, links to certain readings and legal cases, and links to turnitin.com will be posted on the web site, as will important class announcements. Accordingly, students should check the web site regularly.

Turnitin

Written assignments are subject to submission for textual similarity review to the commercial plagiarism detection software under license to the University for the detection of plagiarism. All papers submitted for such checking will be included as source documents in the reference database for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of papers subsequently submitted to the system. Use of the service is subject to the licensing agreement, currently between Western University and Turnitin.com (<http://www.turnitin.com>).

Assignments can be submitted to turnitin.com through OWL. Note that assignments have not been submitted “on time” unless they have been submitted to turnitin.com *prior* to being submitted in hard copy form at seminar. A copy of your turnitin receipt must be attached to your work.

Academic Offences (Graduate Students)

Scholastic offences are taken seriously and students are directed to read the appropriate policy, specifically, the definition of what constitutes a Scholastic Offence, at the following web site: http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/handbook/appeals/scholastic_discipline_grad.pdf

Extensions

Extensions are not given. However, when there are genuine and unavoidable family or medical circumstances, students may seek academic accommodation. If you fail to hand in an assignment but are pursuing academic accommodation, please advise your Professor of this fact.

Computer Problems

Students are expected to back up their written work and lecture/tutorial notes. Furthermore, students will be responsible for finding replacement lecture/tutorial notes where they fail to back-up their files. Extensions are not granted for computer-related problems.

Learning Objectives

By the end of the course, students should be able to identify the key themes and debates surrounding the advent of identity politics and its relevance to Canadian politics. They should also be familiar with theories that employ substantive notions of identity to ground claims for group rights and critiques of said theories. Students should also be able to demonstrate an awareness of the way in which identity can be deployed by those with power against members of

minority social groups.

Evaluation

Participation 25%

Seminar Assignment 20%

Research Essay 55% (Due April 17)

Seminar Assignment

Commencing in week 3 of the course, students will be assigned seminar duties. A sign-up sheet is posted on my office door. No more than two students may sign up for any given week. There are two components to this assignment. First, each student will make a brief presentation to the class to present his or her own views and observations about the week's readings. Presentations may run for no more than **7 minutes**, and will be timed, as is the case with conference presentations.

Second, students will craft two discussion questions to present to the class, which they will provide in written form to the instructor. The idea here is to pose questions that draw out themes and debates in the required readings with a view to *engaging the class around the issues identified*. Where more than one student is scheduled to present to the class in the same week, they should communicate with one another about the focus of their discussion questions in order to avoid undue repetition.

Participation

Course participation constitutes a weekly assignment. Participation grades will be assigned for each week's class and will be based on the quality of the contribution made to the seminar discussion in accordance with the guidelines below. More specifically, the grades assigned will reflect *whether a student's contribution to class discussions demonstrates a familiarity with, and understanding of, the week's readings*. Students who attend seminar but do not contribute to the seminar discussion will be **assigned a grade of zero** for the week. **Students who do not attend at least 9 seminars between weeks 2-13 will not pass the course or receive a course credit.** Students who find participating in class discussions challenging are encouraged to come to class with prepared discussion questions to pose to the class.

Participation Grading Guide

Grade		Discussion	Reading
85-100	Always	Excellent: leads debate; offers analysis and comments; always has ideas on theme of reading; takes care not to dominate; asks questions	Clearly has done and prepared questions on virtually all readings; intelligently uses this understanding and these questions in discussion

75-84	Almost always	Very Good: thoughtful comments and questions for the most part; willing, able and frequent contributor	Has done most readings; provides competent analysis of reading when prompted by others
65-74	Frequent	Good: has basic grasp of key concepts and occasional ideas on the main theme of the reading; arguments are sporadic and at times incomplete or poorly supported; unwilling to ask questions	Displays familiarity with most readings, but tends not to analyze them or to relate them to the course material
50-64	Occasional	Somewhat Poor: remarks in class marred by misunderstandings of key concepts; seldom contributes effectively to discussion of the main theme; often digresses in unhelpful ways; sporadic	Actual knowledge of material is outweighed by improvised comments and remarks
0-49	Rare	Poor: rarely speaks; parrots text or comments of others	Little or no apparent familiarity with assigned material

Research Essay

Students will write a 4000-4500 word paper with the same due date. The expectation is that students will carry on with one of the week's themes, students may formulate a different topic that they see as relevant to the course in consultation with the Professor.

Essays must include footnotes, endnotes, or parenthetical citation and a bibliography organized according to the Chicago style. As a general guide, graduate students' papers should include a bibliography with *no fewer than* 10 academic sources. While it is acceptable to incorporate some class readings into the essay, as this is a research paper, class readings should not constitute a large percentage of the student bibliography.

Essays must be double spaced, submitted in hard copy form with a turnitin receipt attached. Email submissions will not be accepted. Extensions only will be granted where recommended by Academic Counselling. A 2% penalty per day will be assessed to late assignments without extensions.

Class Schedule

Week 1: January 8: Introduction to the Course

Week 2: January 16 New Social Movements: the Rise of Identity Politics and Its Significance

Offe, Claus. "New Social Movements: Challenging the Boundaries of Institutional Politics." *Social Research* 52, 4 (1985): 817-68.

Weir, Lorna, "Limitations of New Social Movement Analysis. *Studies in Political Economy* 40 (1993): 73-102. **(73-88 only)**

Week 3: January 23 Critics and Responses

Fraser, Nancy. "From Redistribution to Recognition? Dilemmas of Justice in a 'Post-Socialist' Age." *New Left Review* 212 (1995): 68-93.

Coombs, Mary. "Interrogating Identity." Review Essay: *Notes of a White Black Woman: Race, Color, Community*, by Judy Scales-Trent. *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* (A Collaborative Work with the African-American Law and Policy Report) (1996): 222-49.

Jenson, Jane. "Naming Nations: Making Nationalist Claims in Canadian Political Discourse." *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 30, 3 (1993): 337-58.

Part II: Identity Politics: Canadian Contributions

Week 4: January 30 Charles Taylor and (some of) his Critics

- * Taylor, Charles. "The Politics of Recognition." In *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, ed. Amy Gutmann, 25-73. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- * Appiah, K. Anthony. "Identity, Authenticity, Survival: Multicultural Societies and Social Reproduction." In *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, ed. Amy Gutmann, 149-163. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- * Wolf, Susan. "Comment." In *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, ed. Amy Gutmann, 75-85. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.

Week 5: February 6
Will Kymlicka

- * Kymlicka, Will. *Liberalism, Community and Culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989.
 - Ch. 8 - “The Value of Cultural Membership.” (162-181).
 - Ch. 9 - “Equality for Minority Cultures.” (182-205).
- * Kymlicka, Will. *Multicultural Citizenship*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995.
 - Ch. 8 - “Toleration and its Limits.” **(164-170 only)**.

Week 6: February 13
Avigail Eisenberg

- Eisenberg, Avigail. “The Politics of Individual and Group Difference in Canadian Jurisprudence.” *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 27, 1 (1994): 3-21.
- Eisenberg, Avigail. “Diversity and Equality: Three Approaches to Cultural and Sexual Difference.” *The Journal of Political Philosophy* 11, 1 (2003): 41-64. **(50-62 only)**
- Green, Joyce. “The Difference Debate: Reducing Rights to Cultural Flavours.” *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 33, 1 (2000): 133-44.
- * Dick, Caroline. “Eisenberg’s Theory of Identity-Related Interests.” In *The Perils of Identity: Group Rights and the Politics of Intragroup Difference*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011. **(99-107 only)**.

READING WEEK: no class on February 20

Part III: Canadian Identity Politics

Week 7: February 27
Ethnicity/Multiculturalism

- * Ryan, Phil. *Multicultiphobia*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010.
 - “Introduction.” **(3-18 only)**.
 - Ch. 1 - “Classics of Multicultiphobia.” (29-42).
 - * Abu-Laban, Yasmeen, and Christina Gabriel. *Selling Diversity: Immigration, Multiculturalism, Employment Equity and Globalization*. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 2002. (Chapter 4 and skim 6)
- Banting, Keith, and Will Kymlicka. “Canadian Multiculturalism: Global Anxieties and Local

Debates.” *British Journal of Canadian Studies* 23, 1 (2010): 43-72.

Week 8: March 6

Race

Nath, Nisha. “Defining Narratives of Identity in Canadian Political Science: Accounting for the Absence of Race.” *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 44, 1 (2011): 161-93.

* Thobani, Sunera. “Multiculturalism and the Liberalizing Nation.” In *Exalted Subjects: Studies on the Making of Race and Nation in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2007.

* Razack, Sherene H. “What Is to Be Gained by Looking White People in the Eye?” Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1998.

* Razack, Sherene H. “Gendered Racial Violence and Spacialized Justice: The Murder of Pamela George.” In *Race, Space, and the Law: Unmapping a White Settler Society*, ed. Sherene H. Razack, 121-56. Toronto: Between the Lines, 2002.

Week 9: March 13

Trans Politics

* Namaste, Viviane. *Sex Change, Social Change: Reflections on Identity, Institutions and Imperialism*. Toronto: Women’s Press, 2005. **(1-33 only)**.

* Spade, Dean. “What’s Wrong with Rights?” In *Normal Life: Administrative Violence, Critical Trans Politics, and the Limits of Law*. Brooklyn, New York: South End Press, 2011.

Mandlis, Lane R. “Human Rights, Transsexed Bodies, and Health Care in Canada: What Counts as Legal Protection?” *Canadian Journal of Law and Society* 26, 3 (2011): 509-29.

Saeidzadeh, Zara. “Transsexuality in Contemporary Iran: Legal and Social Misrecognition.” *Feminist Legal Studies* 24 (2016): 249-72. (Skim)

Week 10: March 20

Disability in the Context of Sexual Assault

* Devlin, Richard, and Dianne Pothier. “Introduction: Toward a Critical Theory of Dis-Citizenship.” In *Critical Disability Theory: Essays in Philosophy, Politics, Policy, and Law*, ed. Dianne Pothier and Richard Devlin. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006.

Razack, Sherene H. “From Consent to Responsibility, from Pity to Respect: Subtexts in Cases of Sexual Violence Involving Girls and Women with Developmental Disabilities.” *Law and Social Inquiry* 19, 4 (1994): 891-922.

Benedet, Janine, and Isabel Grant. "Hearing Sexual Assault Complaints of Women with Mental Disabilities: Consent, Capacity and Mistaken Belief." *52 McGill Law Journal* (2007): 243-89.

Part IV: Deploying Identity Against the 'Other'

Week 11: March 27

Gay Men (Gay Panic and MSM)

* Janoff, Douglas Victor. "Homo-cide: Getting Away with It?" In *Pink Blood: Homophobic Violence in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005.

* Faulkner, Ellen. "Sexualities and Difference: The Victimization of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer (LGBTQ) People in Canada." In *Diversity Crime and Justice in Canada*, 2d ed., ed. Barbara Perry, 256-84. Don Mills: Oxford University Press, 2016.
https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Ellen_Faulkner3/publication/314046436_Faulkner_Ellen_2016_Sexualities_and_Difference_The_Criminalization_of_Lesbian_Gay_Bisexual_Transgendered_and_Queer_LGBTQ_People_in_Canada_Reprinted_in_Barbara_Perry_Ed_Diversity_Crime_and_Justice_in_C/links/58b2008ea6fdcc6f03f93559/Faulkner-Ellen-2016-Sexualities-and-Difference-The-Criminalization-of-Lesbian-Gay-Bisexual-Transgendered-and-Queer-LGBTQ-People-in-Canada-Reprinted-in-Barbara-Perry-Ed-Diversity-Crime-and-Justi.pdf

Weinberg, Mark A., Talia Shuldiner, Karine Dahl and Norbert Gilmore. "Reconsidering the lifetime deferral of blood donation by men who have sex with men." *Canadian Medical Association* 182, 12 (2010): 1321-24.
<http://www.cmaj.ca/content/cmaj/182/12/1321.full.pdf>

Goldman, Mindy, Don Lapierre, Lorna Lemay, Dana Devine and Graham Sher. "Donor Criteria for men who have sex with men: a Canadian perspective." *Transfusion* 54 (2014): 1887-1892.
https://blood.ca/sites/default/files/transfusion_2014.pdf

Billick, Maxime, Jeremy Cygler, Bellal Jubran, Kelly Lau, Emily Hodgson and Gabriel Devlin. "Blood Donation Deferrals: Re-Evaluating the five year deferral period for blood donation by MSM." Canadian Federation of Medical Students. April 2015.
<https://www.cfms.org/files/position-papers/2015%20CFMS%20Blood%20Donation%20Deferral.pdf>

Week 12: April 3

The Constitutional Rights of Aboriginal Peoples

Pfefferle, Brian R. "The Indefensibility of Post-Colonial Aboriginal Rights." *Saskatchewan Law Review* (2007): 393-423.

Dick, Caroline. “Culture and the Courts’ Revisited: Group-Rights Scholarship and the Evolution of s.35(1).” *Canadian Journal of Political Science*. 42, 4 (2009): 957-79.

Goldenberg, André. “‘Salmon for Peanut Butter’: Equality, Reconciliation and the Rejection of Commercial Aboriginal Rights.” *Indigenous Law Journal* 3, 1 (2004): 61-110.

Part V: Reclaiming Identity

Week 13: April 10

Indigenous Resurgence: Rejecting the Liberal Rights Paradigm

* Coulthard, Glen Sean. *Red Skin, White Masks: Rejecting the Colonial Politics of Recognition*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2014. (Chapter 1 and Conclusion)

Corntassel, Jeff. “Re-envisioning Resurgence: Indigenous Pathways to Decolonization and Sustainable Self-determination.” *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education and Society* 1, 1 (2012): 86-101.

<http://www.decolonization.org/index.php/des/article/view/18627/15550>

Alcantara, Christopher, and Caroline Dick. “Decolonization in a Digital Age: Cryptocurrencies and Indigenous Self-Determination in Canada.” *Canadian Journal of Law and Society* 32, 1 (2017): 19-35.