

Politics 9504b/Philosophy 9122b (Winter 2017)

Political Theory II: Toleration and Political Disagreement

Instructor: Richard Vernon ravernon@uwo.ca SSC 4216

In this course we shall examine the emergence of toleration as a political topic, in the debate between John Locke and Jonas Proast (1689-1704), consider the contemporary significance of toleration and the moral and/or epistemological premises on which it can be based, and finally consider three alternative approaches to disagreement that may replace toleration: deliberative democracy, the ethics of compromise, and the idea of “recognition.”

Topics and readings are listed below. Readings will be posted on OWL or made available for photocopy. The only required text is *Locke on Toleration* (Cambridge UP 2010, available in UWO bookstore and Weldon).

Evaluation: a final essay, due April 15, worth 70%; class participation, 30%. The essay (15-20 pages is expected) will critically explore one of the week’s topics, while also showing an appreciation of its place in the overall theme of the class. I am open to proposals for essay topics that will span two or more weeks’ readings.

Jan 09 – introduction to the course

Jan 16 – Locke’s toleration – was it Protestant, fallibilist, or egalitarian? Let’s discuss it: *Locke on Toleration* pp 1-66.

Jan 23 – Locke’s toleration – was it Protestant, fallibilist, or egalitarian? Let’s discuss it some more: *Locke on Toleration*, remainder of book

Jan 30 – Interpretations: Vernon, *Locke on Toleration*, Introduction; Jeremy Waldron “Locke, Toleration and the Rationality of Persecution” in Susan Mendus ed, *Toleration*, Adam Wolfson *Persecution or Toleration?* chapter 4

Feb 6 – Toleration today (?): Bernard Williams “Toleration: A Moral or Political Question?” *Diogenes* 44 (1996), George Fletcher “The Instability of Tolerance”, in David Heyd ed. *Toleration: An Elusive Virtue*, T.M.Scanlon *The Difficulty of Tolerance* chapter 10

Feb 13– Toleration: good thing or bad? Wendy Brown *Regulating Aversion*, chapter 2, Samuel Scheffler “The Good of Toleration”, in *Equality and Tradition*

Feb 27 – Explaining conflict (1) – we are all fallible: David Christensen “Disagreement as Evidence”, *Philosophy Compass* 4/5 (2009), Thomas Kelly “The Epistemic Significance of Disagreement and the Burdens of Judgment” in Gendler and Hawthorne eds. *Oxford Studies in Epistemology*, John Horton, “Reasonable

Disagreement” in M. Dimova-Cookson and P. Stirk eds., *Multiculturalism and Moral Conflict*

Mar 6 – Explaining conflict (2) -- the moral-pluralist case: Isaiah Berlin *The Crooked Timber of Humanity* chapter 2, Joseph Raz “Autonomy, Toleration and the Harm Principle” in Mendus ed. *Toleration*, Steven Lukes “Making Sense of Moral Conflict” in Nancy Rosenblum ed. *Liberalism and the Moral Life*

Mar 13 – alternatives to toleration (1) – “agonism”: W.B. Gallie “Essentially Contested Concepts”, *Proceedings of the Aristotelean Society* 1956, Carl Schmitt *The Concept of the Political*

Mar 20 – alternatives to toleration (2) – deliberative democracy: Amy Gutmann & David Thompson “Moral Conflict and Political Consensus” in R.B. Douglass et al eds., *Liberalism and the Good*, Stanley Fish “Mutual Respect as a Device of Exclusion” and Ian Shapiro “Enough of Deliberation: Politics is about Interests and Power” (both in Stephen Macedo ed *Deliberative Politics*), Iris Young *Intersecting Voices* chapter 3

Mar 27 – alternatives to toleration (3) -- the ethics of compromise: Simon C. May “Principled Compromise and the Abortion Controversy” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 33 (2005), Daniel Weinstock “On the Possibility of Principled Compromise” *CRISPP* 16 (2013), Chiara Lapora and Robert Goodin *On Complicity and Compromise* chapter 2

April 3 – alternatives to toleration (4) – “recognition”: Anna E. Galeotti *Toleration as Recognition* chapters 3 &4, Peter Jones “Toleration, Recognition and Identity” *Journal of Political Philosophy* 14 (2006), John Horton “Why the traditional concept of toleration still matters” *CRISPP* 2011