

## Politics 9504b – Political Theory II (Winter 2015-6)

Instructor: Richard Vernon ([ravernon@uwo.ca](mailto:ravernon@uwo.ca))

*Accommodating Difference: From Toleration to Inclusion (?)*

The idea that a political society can accommodate basic ideological and moral differences emerges in late 17<sup>th</sup>-century debates over the possibility of religious toleration. The triumph of the idea of toleration is often taken to have set the framework within which later discussions of accommodating difference have been formed: but ideas of “pluralism” and “recognition” do not fit comfortably within the toleration idea. This seminar will begin by considering a seminal debate, in the 1690s, between John Locke and a persistent critic, Jonas Proast (who is sometimes still thought to have won the debate). What was the basis of Locke’s case – was it religious in nature, or skeptical, or related to his contractualist political theory? After discussing some recent views of the problematic nature of toleration, we move on to consider J.S. Mill’s *On Liberty*, his attempt to ground the defence of liberty in utilitarianism, and the extent of the liberty that he defends; and then to discuss the idea of “moral pluralism” that some see in Mill’s case. Finally, we examine two influential 20<sup>th</sup>-century contributions: Will Kymlicka’s attempt to build group accommodations on an individualist foundation, and Charles Taylor’s more communitarian idea of recognition; we also read critics who maintain that such proposals fail to supersede the “toleration” framework.

Texts: *Locke on Toleration* (CUP), *Mill’s On Liberty and Other Essays* (OUP), both paperbacks in UWO bookstore. Other readings will be made available for personal photocopy.

Evaluation: a term paper, due at the end of term, on a topic to be agreed with the instructor = 70%; class participation = 30%.

Jan. 4 – introduction to the course

Jan 11 -- Locke, *A Letter Concerning Toleration*, Proast *The Argument of the LCT Briefly Considered and Answered*, Jeremy Waldron “Locke, Toleration and the Rationality of Persecution”, in Susan Mendus ed. *Justifying Toleration*.

Jan 18. Locke, *A Second Letter Concerning Toleration*, Proast, *A Third Letter Concerning Toleration...* (both excerpted in *Locke on Toleration*).

Jan 25 -- Locke, *A Third Letter for Toleration*, Proast, *A Second Letter to the Author of the Three Letters...*, Locke, *A Fourth Letter...* (all excerpted in *Locke on Toleration*).

Feb 1 -- The difficulty of toleration: Bernard Williams, "Toleration: an Impossible Virtue?", George Fletcher, "The Instability of Tolerance", T.M. Scanlon, "The Difficulty of Tolerance", all in David Heyd ed., *Toleration: An Elusive Virtue*.

Feb 8 -- J.S. Mill, *Utilitarianism* chapter 2, *On Liberty* chapters 1-3

Feb 22 -- J.S. Mill, *On Liberty* chapters 4-5.

Feb 29 -- Interpretations: on freedom of "expression", David Dyzenhaus, "Mill and the Harm of Pornography" (*Ethics* 1992 534-51), Robert Skipper, "Mill and Pornography" (*Ethics* 1993 726-30). On cultural accommodation, Jeremy Waldron, "Mill and Multiculturalism", in C.L. Ten ed., *Mill's On Liberty*, and Shefali Misra, "Friend not Foe", *European Journal of Political Theory* 2012.

March 7 – Moral Pluralism: Isaiah Berlin, "J.S. Mill and the Ends of Life", in his *Four Essays in Liberty*, Joseph Raz, "Toleration, Autonomy and the Harm Principle", in Susan Mendus ed. *Justifying Toleration*, and George Crowder, "From Value Pluralism to Liberalism", in Richard Bellamy and Martin Hollis eds., *Pluralism and Liberal Neutrality*.

March 14 -- Will Kymlicka, *Liberalism, Community and Culture*, chapter ?, and *Multicultural Citizenship*, chapter 5: Chandran Kukathas, "Are There Any Cultural Rights?" in Kymlicka ed., *Rights of Minority Cultures*

March 21 -- Charles Taylor, "The Politics of Recognition", in Amy Gutmann ed., *Multiculturalism*, Anthony Appiah, *The Ethics of Identity*, chapter 4

March 28 -- Anna E. Galeotti, *Toleration as Recognition*, chapters 3-4, Peter Jones ? and ?

April 4 -- John Horton, "Why the Traditional Conception of Toleration Still Matters", *CRISPP* 2011 289-305.